



بسم الله الرحمن الرحيم

Summary of Quranic Sciences

Lesson 19: Evaluating Tafsir al-Qommi and Bayan al-Sa'ada on distortion

In his attempt to prove that all Shias believe in the distortion (تحريف) of the Quran, the orientalist Ignác Goldziher references two works: ****Tafsir Ali ibn Ibrahim al-Qommi**** and ****Bayan ul-Sa'ada fi Maqamat al-Ibada**** by Bidokhti Gonabadi. However, critical evaluations of these works challenge his claims.

Tafsir Ali ibn Ibrahim al-Qommi

Scholars have raised significant doubts regarding the attribution of this tafsir to Ali ibn Ibrahim al-Qommi. The authorship is not firmly established, and the book is characterized by خلط (a mixture of content without order) and اضطراب (instability and confusion). Furthermore, the hadiths in the tafsir are problematic. Some are narrated by al-Qommi's student, Abu al-Fadl al-Abbas, while others are attributed to Abu Jarud and various other narrators through Abu al-Fadl. There are also sections believed to have been written by Abu al-Fadl himself, suggesting that parts of the text were authored by someone other than Ali ibn Ibrahim or his immediate circle. Notably, the name Abu al-Fadl Abbas ibn Muhammad does not appear in any of the recognized Rijal books, raising further concerns about the reliability of the narrations.

Bayan ul-Sa'ada fi Maqamat el-Ibada

This work was authored by ****Sultan Muhammad bin Haydar al-Bidokhti al-Gonabadi****, a Sufi leader of the Ni'matullahi order, in 1311 AH. Goldziher,



IMAM SADIQ peace be upon him
ONLINE SEMINARY

in an attempt to support his distortion claims, altered the date of the book from 1311 to 311 AH and even modified the author's name to Sultan Muhammad bin Hajal al-Badokhti. His intentional manipulation misrepresented this Sufi work as an ancient source.

Finally, contemporary figures such as Shaykh Khalid Abd al-Rahman al-Akki have perpetuated Goldziher's unfounded claims. However, it is illogical to attribute the ideas of a Sufi leader as representative of Shia beliefs on the distortion of the Quran.